The Importance of Culture and Context for Development Policy

> Nathan Nunn Harvard University

DRI Annual Conference 2018

October 11, 2018

### **Overview**

There is accumulating evidence showing that:

- 1. There are important differences in cultural traits across societies.
- 2. These are historically determined through an evolutionary process.
- 3. Both history and culture matter for economic development.

## **Overview**

There is accumulating evidence showing that:

- 1. There are important differences in cultural traits across societies.
- 2. These are historically determined through an evolutionary process.
- 3. Both history and culture matter for economic development.

**Question:** Is it necessary to understand the historical and cultural context of a society if one is only interested in implementing policies aimed at improving the world?

## **Overview**

There is accumulating evidence showing that:

- 1. There are important differences in cultural traits across societies.
- 2. These are historically determined through an evolutionary process.
- 3. Both history and culture matter for economic development.

**Question:** Is it necessary to understand the historical and cultural context of a society if one is only interested in implementing policies aimed at improving the world?

< □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > <

• I'll argue: Yes!

#### Culture, context, and development policy

< □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > <

Will provide three examples to illustrate this:

- 1. Health and medicine
- 2. Agriculture
- 3. Education

HEALTH 27 SEPTEMBER 2014

# Guinea residents 'refusing' Ebola treatment

Residents say people frightened to go to clinics because of conspiracy theories that they will be killed by doctors.

#### **EPIDEMIC**

# *'Fear and Distrust': Red Cross Workers Come Under Attack as Ebola Spreads in Congo*

While volunteering to combat the deadly virus in the Democratic Republic of Congo, three Red Cross volunteers were violently attacked.



Divia Messer10.04.18 12:41 PM ET





#### **Colonial medical campaigns**





◆□> ◆□> ◆豆> ◆豆> ・豆 ・ のへで

#### French colonial medical campaigns

- Goal was to eradicate sleeping sickness (trypanosomiasis).
- Villagers were required (often at gun point) to submit to physical exams.
- Early treatment was an arsenic-based drug called *atoxyl*.
  - Caused (at least partial) blindness in 20% of those treated.



#### Success of World Bank development projects

Source: Lowes and Montero (2018)



8

э

(日)、

(a) Health Projects, No controls

#### Blood test refusals rates: By country

Source: Lowes and Montero (2018)





#### Blood test refusals rates: All countries

Source: Lowes and Montero (2018)



#### Medical distrust closer to home (Tuskegee) Source: Alsan and Wanamaker (2018)

Panel C. 55-64 Mortality Rate





## Lost in the maize Why fertiliser subsidies in Africa have not worked

▲ロト ▲帰 ト ▲ ヨ ト ▲ ヨ ト ・ ヨ ・ の Q ()

Good intentions, poor results

The rest of the world is fed because of the use of good seed and inorganic fertilizer, full stop. This technology has not been used in most of Africa. The only way you can help farmers get access to it is give it away free or subsidize it heavily.

Fertilizer Consumption in Selected Regions (1961-2013)

- Stephen Carr<sup>1</sup>





・ロト ・ 理 ト ・ ヨ ト ・ ヨ ト

э

#### **Ongoing exploratory research in Central Africa**



くしゃ (中)・(中)・(中)・(日)

#### The consequences of agricultural success in the DRC

Evidence from vignettes (an example):

• "Imagine we are in a village outside of Kananga. The primary crop is maize. Imagine that one farmer, named Mutombo, has a maize harvest that is twice as large as all other farmers in the village."

#### Vignettes: Perceived origins of success

What will others believe is the most likely reason for Mutombo's success? (n = 165)

◆□▶ ◆□▶ ◆臣▶ ◆臣▶ 臣 のへぐ

#### Vignettes: Perceived origins of success

What will others believe is the most likely reason for Mutombo's success? (n = 165)

- 65: Use of fetishes / witchcraft / ancestors
- 37: Hard work
- **39:** Prayer / blessings from God
- 22: Skill
  - 2: Good luck

#### **Vignettes: Consequences of success**

- In the same year, one of the other farmers has a particularly terrible harvest and his crop was completely eaten by insects.
- How likely is it that others will blame Mutombo for the ruined crop?

- **36:** Very likely
- 80: Likely
- 18: Neither likely nor unlikely
- 19: Unlikely
- 14: Very unlikely

#### Vignettes: Redistributive pressures

• Will other people in the village expect Mutombo to share some of his new wealth with them?

- 24: Yes, everyone will.
- 32: Yes, most people will.
- 41: Yes, family and close friends will.
- 27: Yes, family will.
- 43: No, no one will.

#### **Vignettes: Sabotaging success**

• How likely is it that other members of the village will try to sabotage Mutombo's crop in some way?

▲ロト ▲帰 ト ▲ ヨ ト ▲ ヨ ト ・ ヨ ・ の Q ()

- **30:** Very likely
- 92: Likely
- 26: Neither likely nor unlikely
- 17: Unlikely
  - 2: Very unlikely

#### **Global prevalence of such beliefs**



Data: Pew Forum Surveys 2009 - 2016

◆□▶ ◆□▶ ◆三▶ ◆三▶ 三三 のへで



- In 1973, the Indonesian government launched a program that built 61,807 primary schools over seven years.
- It was the biggest school construction project ever undertaken.

• Was it a success?

◆□▶ ◆□▶ ◆臣▶ ◆臣▶ 臣 のへぐ

• It had a large effect on boys' education,

 It had a large effect on boys' education, but no effect on girls' education.

(ロ)、(型)、(E)、(E)、 E) の(の)

- It had a large effect on boys' education, but no effect on girls' education.
- However, the zero effect masks significant heterogeneity:
  - 1. For some ethnic groups, the effect was positive and very large.

< □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > <

2. For others, the effect was zero.

- It had a large effect on boys' education, but no effect on girls' education.
- However, the zero effect masks significant heterogeneity:
  - 1. For some ethnic groups, the effect was positive and very large.

- 2. For others, the effect was zero.
- The same thing is also found in Zambia.

- It had a large effect on boys' education, but no effect on girls' education.
- However, the zero effect masks significant heterogeneity:
  - 1. For some ethnic groups, the effect was positive and very large.

- 2. For others, the effect was zero.
- The same thing is also found in Zambia.
- What's going on?

#### Marriage customs

**Bride Price:** Payment from the groom and/or groom's parents to the bride's parents at marriage.



#### Variation in the practice of bride price Source: Ashraf, Bau, Nunn, and Voena (forthcoming)



(a) Prevalence in Indonesia



(b) Prevalence in Zambia

#### Education and bride price in Zambia

#### Source: Ashraf, Bau, Nunn, and Voena (forthcoming)

Think about the factors that affect bride price today

What is the most important factor?					
		First	Second	Third	
Education	obs	543 37.3%	223 15.3%	152 10.4%	
Good morals	obs	191 13.1%	283 19.4%	216 14.8%	
Family values	obs	214 14.7%	272 18.7%	206 14.2%	
Virginity	obs	137 9.4%	186 12.8%	179 12.3%	
Age	obs	41 2.8%	94 6.5%	141 9.7%	
Ethnicity	obs	104 7.1%	117 8.0%	190 13.1%	
Other	obs	144 9.9%	118 8.1%	85 5.8%	

#### The 'Lobola' calculator app

LOBOLA CALCULATOR	Lobola Calculat Rope Robert Matsaneng - Octobe Entertainment Install Add to W	OT er1,2014 fishlist	
The vertex in 1000	C C A 130 characteristic of the second seco	Teleform   Wetcome   Wetcome   Teleform   Teleform   Teleform	♥ </th

◆□ > ◆□ > ◆臣 > ◆臣 > ○臣 ○ のへで

#### History, cultural context, and development policy

- In these examples, the effectiveness of policy depends critically (and in non-obvious ways) on the historical and cultural contexts of the society in question.
- Effective policy requires taking these into account.
- Suggest a need to move beyond the current one-size-fits all strategy.